



OISE COUNCIL

MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF OISE COUNCIL, held on February 23, 2022 at 3:00 p.m. via Zoom

Present:

Prof. Normand Labrie, Interim
Dean
Prof. Katharine Janzen, Chair

Ms. Rushain Abbasi
Mr. David Allens
Ms. Sezen Atacan
Ms. Kerri Bailey
Ms. Vesna Bajic
Prof. Abigail Bakan
Ms. Diana Barrero
Ms. Asmita Bhutani Vij
Prof. Clare Brett
Ms. Samantha Burns
Ms. Missy Chareka
Prof. Charles Chen
Ms. Jennifer Cho
Prof. Anne Marie Chudleigh

Guests:

Ms. Lynne Alexandrova
Ms. Tess Barclay
Ms. Ai-ri Brown
Ms. Lara Cartmale

Regrets:

Ms. Maha Babeker
Prof. Nina Bascia
Prof. Joshua Barker
Prof. Megan Boler
Prof. Jennifer Brant
Prof. Kathy Broad, Vice-Chair
Prof. Yiola Cleovoulou
Prof. Daniel Corral

Dr. Valerie Damasco
Ms. Alison D’Cruz
Ms. Monique Flaccavento
Dr. Sheldon Grabke
Mr. Justin Holloway
Ms. Helen Huang
Dr. Hilary Inwood
Prof. Kaja Jasinska
Ms. Alison Jefferson
Mr. Perry King
Prof. Emmanuelle Le Pichon-
Vorstman
Dr. Carly Manion
Prof. Rhonda Martinussen
Prof. Douglas McDougall
Prof. David Montemurro
Prof. Sarfaroz Niyozov
Prof. Michele Peterson-Badali
Prof. Angela Pyle

Ms. Mindy Harris
Ms. Sim Kapoor
Prof. Evelyn Kipkosgei
Ms. Jessica Lovett
Prof. Ann Lopez

Ms. Julia Duncan
Prof. Diane Farmer
Prof. Rubén Gaztambide-
Fernández
Prof. Meric Gertler
Prof. Kang Lee
Ms. Christine Lowe
Mr. Varun Malik
Dr. Kenneth McNeilly
Prof. Roy Moodley

Ms. Jeananne Robertson
Prof. Creso Sá
Dr. Gurpreet Sahmbi
Ms. Huda Salha
Mr. Said Sidani
Mr. Ian Liujia Tian
Prof. Njoki Wane
Mr. Desmond Wong
Prof. Earl Woodruff
Ms. Zian Zhang

Ms. Biljana Cuckovic, Secretary
of OISE Council

Secretariat:

Ms. Lisa Smith
Ms. Jennifer Tucker
Mr. Doug Ullrich

Prof. Amal Madibbo
Ms. Denise Makovac
Ms. Henrjeta Mece
Ms. Mai Naji

Dr. Elisabeth Rees-Johnstone
Prof. Cheryl Regehr
Dr. Jesse Sims
Mr. Henry Ssali
Mr. Matt Stodolak
Prof. Miglena Todorova
Dr. Lesley Wilton
Ms. Yun Zhan
Prof. Terezia Zoric

Acknowledgement of Traditional Land

The Chair, Professor Katharine Janzen, commenced the meeting by reading the land acknowledgement.

1. Opening Remarks

The Chair welcomed members and guests to the third meeting of OISE Council in 2021-2022, and provided an overview of the participation guidelines for virtual meetings.

2. Review and Approval of Agenda

The Agenda for the meeting was approved.

3. Review and Approval of the Minutes of the Previous Meeting

Minutes of the December 15, 2021 meeting were tabled for approval at the next meeting due to the noted discrepancies in the depiction of discussion related the OISE Excellence Award, and an error regarding graduate students (not Graduate Assistants) being asked to volunteer to perform Teaching Assistants' duties without a proper contract. The revised draft minutes of the December 15, 2021 meeting will be brought forward for approval at the April 27, 2022 meeting of OISE Council.

4. Chair's Report

The Chair reported that at the February 14, 2022 meeting, the Executive discussed strategies to ensure that issues raised at Council meetings are in accordance with specific powers and duties of OISE Council as stipulated in the Constitution; and that Council meetings continue to be engaging for all members.

This was prompted by expressions of concerns that the Chair and Dean received from several members regarding the tone and tenor of recent Council meetings, which was perceived to be inappropriate, and not aligned with principles of collegial governance; that could negatively impact participation at Council meetings. The Executive looked at the Constitution and the specific powers and duties of Council versus those of the administration. They concluded that engaging in a complex process of constitutional review would not be prudent until the appointment of a new Dean of OISE. In the meantime, an orientation material could be developed for incoming members with an overview of basic powers and duties of Council, and clear expectations of members of Council that would reference related existing resources such as the University of Toronto Governing Council's Principles of Good Governance. The possibility of holding a Townhall meeting was also discussed, agreeing that this could be helpful to enhance the space for all constituents to be heard, and for broader issues to be discussed in a dedicated time and space.

A question was raised regarding the issue that was considered to be outside of the purview of OISE Council. The Chair responded that the issue was whether the Council had authority to budget funds for student financial support, and that the tone of that discussion was perceived to be inappropriate and not collegial. A student member, Mr. Justin Holloway, commented that, under the Constitution, OISE Council plays an advisory role to the divisional administration, which was the goal of the student members' update at the December 15, 2021 meeting. At that meeting, the students advised Council about a few achievable supports that the elected student members needed; however, they have not received a response. He further noted that, regardless of the tone in which the students' concerns have been expressed, the core issue is that the students' requests have been ignored by the administration.

The Chair commented that, at the December 15 meeting, the Dean reported extensively on the OISE budget and resources intended for student financial support, and invited his comments regarding the

matter. The Dean responded that, as part of his report to Council, he will follow up on the students' requests expressed at the previous meeting.

Professor Montemurro noted that, while there are some provisions in the Constitution regarding Council's authority to award scholarships, bursaries and prizes, many of the matters regarding student funding do not fall within the day-to-day purview of individual faculty and staff members' activities. By and large, individual Council members do not have the expertise and relevant information to meaningfully engage in discussion and decisions regarding student funding. That was one of the reasons a townhall was suggested as a dedicated space for this discussion to take place. Following a question regarding the purpose of the townhall, the Chair explained that the purpose would be to set aside a dedicated time to discuss student funding questions in more depth, and to understand how, and where best those issues could be addressed.

Mr. Holloway added that, while a townhall would be welcome, it represents a single opportunity to address student concerns; however, student financial precarity at OISE is a more complex issue. Students have articulated these concerns repeatedly and believe that OISE Council, as the highest governing body at the Institute, is a forum to discuss and address these concerns.

The Chair concluded the discussion by noting that, at the next meeting, the Executive will consider the feedback received at today's Council meeting, and determine next steps.

5. Dean's Report

The Interim Dean, Professor Normand Labrie, provided an update on the nine faculty searches, and the searches for two department Chairs, and for the Director of the Dr. Eric Jackman Institute of Child Study, which were all progressing well. The Dean announced the appointment, and welcomed, Professor Amal Madibbo of the Department of Social Justice Education, as the inaugural Director of the Centre for Black Studies in Education (CBSE). The Black Faculty in Conversation event held on February 16, 2022, dedicated to discussing the future of the CBSE, was a huge success with over 300 attendees.

The Sustainability and Climate Action Network (SCAN) webinar, held on the January 31, 2022, successfully launched the SCAN Community Hub focused on broadening the work of OISE's Environmental and Sustainability Education initiative, and furthering the sustainability and climate action work at the Institute. OISE's new Sustainability Fund was also launched, and aims to advance the Institute's Sustainability and Climate Action Plan. Open to faculty, staff, and students, the application deadline is February 28, 2022, and details about the Fund can be found on the SCAN website.

The Dean reported on the plans for a phased return to in-person activities. Some of the Master of Arts in Child Study and Education (MA-CSE) courses are being offered in person at the Dr. Eric Jackman Institute of Child Study. For the May and June intersession, a few courses will be offered in-person while the majority will be offered online. This will benefit the Master of Teaching (MT) students who will work as teachers in early summer, owing to the Ministry of Education's policy to provide Temporary Teacher Certificates to teacher candidates in Ontario. For the July-August session, The MT program surveyed its current students and learned that one third of those surveyed expressed a preference for some in-person classes, while two thirds prefer online classes. As a result, the program developed a schedule to offer more in-person courses in July and August in addition to online courses. Related to the Temporary Teacher Certificate, the Dean praised the work of the MT and MA-CSE program faculty, and colleagues in the Registrar's Office, for making it possible for interested teacher candidates in both programs to apply for this certificate, work, and be compensated as teachers while still completing their programs, which is another way of increasing student financial support.

The Dean reported on the February 7, 2022, racially motivated anti-Asian incident that occurred in an

online platform. The incident was immediately reported to the Provost's Office, Community Safety Office, Campus Police, and Toronto Police. As a result, the Education Commons established a protocol and issued guidelines to increase security of Zoom platform.

Turning to awards, honours and fundraising, the Dean reminded members that nominations for OISE's Staff Excellence Awards are open until early March. Owing to the hard work of Ms. Sim Kapoor, Director of Advancement and External Relations, and her team, a good progress was made in fundraising for new scholarships and awards. Since the last Council meeting, over \$100,000 was received in donations.

In closing his report, the Dean addressed several issues raised at the previous meeting. Regarding the request for the creation of a generic email account for student members of OISE Council, it was explained that, at the University of Toronto, this service is available to faculty and staff only, and students cannot open a generic email account, or shared mailbox, on their own. In case of recognized student groups or associations, the faculty and staff responsible for these groups initiate the creation of a generic email account and request permission for access to students while maintaining ownership of the account. Relatedly, as per the *University Policy on Official Correspondence with Students*, the University has the right and responsibility to provide the infrastructure, such as listservs, to make official communications available to students electronically.

Related to the funding provided to the former OISE Graduate Students Association (GSA), this year, the Dean's Office distributed these funds to the departments for the accredited departmental student associations. There is a carry forward of about \$20,000 in the GSA account, which will remain in the account until the establishment of a new accredited association of OISE graduate students.

Related to Ms. Diana Barerro's comment at the previous meeting that graduate students are being asked to perform duties of Teaching Assistants without being properly compensated, the Dean commented that this was initially understood to be concerning Graduate Assistants (GAs). He noted that instructions to faculty regarding creating GA positions are clear and define GAs as students engaged in research activities who are not permitted to perform teaching-related, nor administrative tasks. Given that Ms. Barrero clarified her comment, the Dean's Office will investigate any specific reports of volunteer work of graduate students.

For Information: Approval of the Not-for-Credit Certificate Program: Continuing Education: Enabling Lifelong Learning

As part of the Dean's report, in accordance with *the University Policy on Certificates (For-Credit and Not-For-Credit)*, and the Constitution of OISE, the approval of the Not-for-Credit certificate program "Continuing Education: Enabling Lifelong Learning" offered by the OISE Continuing and Professional Learning (OISE CPL) was reported to Council for information. OISE CPL's program "Continuing Education: Enabling Lifelong Learning", received decanal approval following a review and recommendation by the CPL's Curriculum Review Committee (CRC) and Professional Advisory Committee (PAC) as per the divisional approval process outlined in the OISE Guideline for Approval of Not-for-Credit Certificates. The document outlining the not-for-credit certificate, target audience, learning outcomes, and an overview of learner assessment was included in the materials for the meeting.

A question was raised regarding the return to in-person activities, and what measures will be taken to improve the ventilation in the building, and provide adequate masks to students and faculty. It was further noted that a survey to allow students to provide feedback regarding in-person learning would be helpful. Another question was raised regarding what is the definition of a recognized student body, and why does it not correlate with elected student representatives on OISE Council.

The Dean responded that return to in-person activities is being considered in light of the need to protect the health and safety of the community, while making adequate pedagogical decisions for teaching and learning. These decisions are academic in nature and are being made collegially at the level of programs. In September 2021, a survey of OISE students was conducted regarding their experiences in online classes, and their interest for future offerings—either in-person or online, which generated data for future planning. Related to student groups, the Dean mentioned that the *University Policy on Recognition of Student Groups* outlines responsibilities and procedures that must be met for a student group to be recognized. He then invited Ms. Helen Hung, CAO, to respond to the question regarding the building. Ms. Huang noted that the issue of air quality is important, and is a frequent topic of discussion at the Joint Health and Safety Committee. The University has a website dedicated to strategies for managing indoor air quality. Most of rooms at OISE meet the standard of a hospital waiting room where air circulates six times per hour. For those rooms that do not meet this standard, the University will install an air purifiers. Regarding masks, the University procured some medical-level masks to provide to those community members who, for any reason such as supply chain disruptions or equity issues, are unable to obtain them. These can be picked up at the Robarts Library. OISE also procured a small amount of N95 masks for emergency use for students who may need them for practica in case the placement sites are unable to provide them.

Mr. Justin Holloway thanked the Dean for his responses to concerns raised at the previous meeting noting that it is odd that OISE Council is unable to generate an official email address for its student members, and that he believed that Council should have the power to do so. Related to the GSA funding, the students heard that this funding was distributed to the departments for the departmental student associations; however, the students have requested the actual proof of this. The former GSA provided many supports such as conference funding, which students have not been receiving since the start of the pandemic. According to the website, funding applications for conferences that occurred in May 2020 are still being processed. Related to the February 7, 2022 incident, Mr. Holloway characterized is as a “violent hate crime”, asked why it was not reported to the Joint Health and Safety Committee, why it took OISE administration eight days to acknowledge on social media the true nature of what had occurred, and whether the perpetrator still poses danger to the community.

The Dean reiterated the procedure regarding the provision of generic email accounts service for faculty and staff. He explained that the majority the former GSA funding, including funding for conference travel, was provided the University of Toronto Graduate Students Union (UTGSU) as part of the incidental fees, and not by the Dean’s Office, which contributed complementary funding. The Dean added the official record of the transfer of the Dean’s Office contribution for the former GSA to the departments constitutes the actual proof of this transfer, and that questions on the expenditure of these funds should be directed to the departments. Regarding the February 7th incident, the Dean’s Office notified the community as soon as it heard about its occurrence, and reported it to the University. It was decided to omit specific details in this communication to avoid further trauma to those who were affected. The Education Commons tried to investigate the perpetrator’s location, and based on the IP address, determined that the threat came from outside the country.

Professor Clare Brett, Chair of the Department of Curriculum, Teaching and Learning (CTL) provided additional context given that the incident occurred at a Zoom meeting hosted by a CTL faculty member. Given that this was a large meeting, and that only a limited number of videos can be viewed on a Zoom screen at a time, only a few attendees saw what occurred. The department leadership is working on solutions to prevent this from happening in the future, such as increasing Zoom security, and supporting those who were impacted without retraumatizing them. Professor Brett added that the Dean’s Office acted swiftly to notify the University and Campus Police, and to inform the community condemning the

incident, and providing links to resources available to support the community.

Professor Michele Peterson-Badali, Associate Dean, Research, International and Innovation, concurred with Professor Brett's and Dean Labrie's position on the need to carefully consider what details need to be included in the communication about the incident in order to avoid sensationalism, and meet particular goals of the communication, such as the condemnation of the incident, and safety of the community. Ms. Helen Huang, CAO, added that as a result of this incident, the Education Commons will raise the basic level of security for all member of the OISE community with Zoom accounts, and will develop additional guidelines for increasing security of Zoom meetings.

A student guest in attendance, reiterated her comments from previous meetings regarding student participation in governance, and noted that, in the absence of OISE GSA, the existing vacant *ex-officio* position intended for the GSA President could be re-assigned to a representative from one of the existing student associations of smaller departments whose student representatives have difficulty being elected to serve on the Council.

Professor Njoki Wane, Chair of the Department of Social Justice Education, shared an experience where the Black community was targeted at a recent Zoom conference on Black Boys Education in Kenya. She noted that putting in place policies and procedure to prevent Zoom bombing is critical.

6. Reports from Standing Committees

- A. Academic Programs** – Professor David Montemurro, Chair of the Academic Programs Committee, reported on the Committee's proposals approved at the meeting held on January 28, 2022, which included two minor changes to existing programs, and three new courses.

For Information: Minor Modifications: Changes to Existing Programs

- Counselling and Clinical Psychology – Field in Clinical and Counselling Psychology – MA
- Counselling Psychology – Field in Counselling and Psychotherapy; and Field in Guidance and Counselling – MEd

For Information: Minor Modifications: New Courses

- APD1257H Child Development and Personal History
- APD1302H Theories and Techniques of Counselling and Psychotherapy – Part II
- CTL3040H The Education of Students of Refugee Background in Canada and Beyond

The Committee also reviewed a number of minor course changes that were approved at the departmental level, and received an update on upcoming proposals from the Acting Associate Dean, Programs.

- B. Equity** – On behalf of Professor Emmanuelle Le Pichon-Vorstman, Chair of the Equity Committee, who left the meeting early, Ms. Helen Huang, CAO and Dean's designate on the Committee reported on the Committee's discussions at the meeting held on February 8, 2022.

A brief account of the first Equity Committee-sponsored event—the 3rd installation of Black Faculty in Conversion held on February 16, 2022, was provided. With over 300 attendees, the virtual event garnered a lot of attention across the University. The panelists spoke about the significance and potential of the newly established Centre for Black Studies in Education (CBSE), and how their research could contribute to the Centre's mandate. Colleagues in the Dean's Office, Education Commons, and OISE Communications, were especially acknowledged for their support of the event. The Equity Committee

created a brief survey to conduct an environmental scan of equity-related programs, initiatives, and events across OISE's departments, centres, and units. The scan aims to provide an opportunity for sharing (not evaluating) information about best practices along with enhancing communication. The second Committee-sponsored event focused on Mental Health & Wellness is scheduled for March 16, 2022. Additionally, the Committee members are working with the OISE Library to identify resources on mental health, for faculty and students, that will be added to the Equity Focused Digital Pedagogy and Learning Research Guide webpage on the Library website.

- C. Research** – On behalf of Professor Rubén Gaztambide-Fernández, Chair of the Research Committee, who was absent from the meeting, Ms. Henrjeta Mece, Vice-Chair, reported on the Committee's proposals and discussions at the meeting held on January 19, 2022.

For Information: EDU-C Renewal: Centre for the Study of Canadian & International Higher Education (CIHE)

Ms. Mece reported that the Research Committee of OISE Council accepted the recommendation of its subcommittee, and approved the renewal of Centre for the Study of Canadian & International Higher Education (CIHE) for a 2-year term, effective May 1, 2022.

While most OISE EDU-Cs were reviewed in 2018-2019, the CIHE was not reviewed at that time as it had previously undergone a review as a part of a status change from an EDU-D in April, 2017. In the fall of 2021, the Director of CIHE submitted a self-study on behalf of the Centre in accordance with the divisional review process. On December 13, 2021, a subcommittee of the Research Standing Committee met to review the self-study. After evaluating and discussing this self-study, the subcommittee of the Research Standing Committee unanimously recommended renewal of this Centre for a 2-year term. The proposed term serves the administrative purpose of realigning the Centre's review timeline with that of the majority of OISE EDU-Cs. The committee emphasized the CIHE's contribution to OISE, particularly in acting as a valuable research network for students and faculty, taking on the Journal of Higher Education, and providing learning opportunities for graduate students.

7. Adjournment

Before adjourning the meeting, the Chair asked if there are any additional comments or brief updates.

A student member, Ms. Diana Barerro, expressed concern that she wanted to share earlier in the discussion regarding framing of OISE Council's duties pertaining to academic matters, including teaching and research, as separated from financial decision-making recognizing that this is a broader issue at the University. She added that faculty who are invested in teaching and research, as well as students, are increasingly sidelined in decision-making about these important issues.

The Chair thanked all member and guest for their contributions at the meeting, and advised members that the next meeting of OISE Council will be held on April 27, 2022 at 3:00 p.m.

The meeting was adjourned at 4:21 p.m.